

Turkish-Russian Cooperation in Procurement S-400 TRIUMF Missile System 2019



Hendra Maujana Saragih¹, Agung Tri Laksono²

^{1,2}International Relations Department Universitas Nasional, Jakarta, Indonesia.

ABSTRACT: This study aims to explain the reasons for Turkey to purchase Russian S-400 missiles which have reached payment transactions in 2019, amidst Turkey's existence as a member of NATO and an American ally. Turkey's decision to purchase Russian S-400 ballistic missile weapons has been classified as a unilateral move that violates the alliance agreement with the United States. Meanwhile, on the other hand, Turkey's decision to join in the purchase of Russian S-400 missile weapons is needed to make a good impact in relation to Turkey and Russia's future relations. This study is using several theories, such as: Geopolitics, International Politics, National Interests, and Balance of Threat. This research tries to explain the existence of several engagements from Russia that made Turkey decide to buy S-400 weapons. Turkey views cooperation with Russia as a way to prevent and minimize conflicts with Russia in the future.

KEYWORDS: Cooperation, Defense, NATO, S-400, Alliance, Agreement, Turkey, Russian.

I. INTRODUCTION

In order to increase its influence and power, Russia cooperates with several countries. Turkey's geographical environment is fraught with air threats. The challenges facing include essential elements of air force, which are manifested through the involvement of flexible and manoeuvrable aircraft, along with the more complex threats posed by ballistic missiles and cruise missiles. Currently, four countries in the region (Russia, Israel, Saudi Arabia, and Greece) have an air force that does not surpass Turkey in terms of strength.¹ The incident involving the shooting of a Russian Su-24 jet in 2015 serves as a real proof of the tense diplomatic relationship between the two countries. After fluctuations in diplomatic relations, Turkey and Russia finally had a positive turn after working together on the Syrian issue. The conflict in Syria has been ongoing since 2011, marking the nine-year duration since it began in the region. The complexity of the Syrian war goes beyond the obvious dichotomy of one side against the other. Key players in the Syrian conflict include a Syrian army loyal to the Assad regime, anti-Assad forces, and the presence of the Islamic State. (IS). The multi-faceted nature of this situation adds a layer of complexity to the ongoing conflict in the region.² Turkey's involvement in the Syrian conflict is driven by an aspiration to build peace and social justice for Syrian people, combined with a desire to alleviate the suffering caused by President Assad's regime.

Turkey and Russia began moving closer to Syria, a major conflict point between the two counties as Ankara has long supported rebel groups seeking to overthrow Syrian President Bashar al-Assad, Turkey's close ally Russia has sent troops and warplanes to defend Turkey's national security.³ The military operations launched by the two countries irritated each other and ultimately increased the tension of rivalry in Syria. This is because Turkey and Russia support different groups. Russia supports Assad's group. Meanwhile, Turkey is behind the masses against Assad, especially in the Idlib region. Even the two did not hesitate to attack each other's statements because of the Syrian conflict. The challenges facing include essential elements of air force, which are manifested through the involvement of flexible and manoeuvrable aircraft, along with the more complex threats posed by ballistic missiles and cruise missiles. Currently, four countries in the region (Russia, Israel, Saudi Arabia, and Greece) have an air force that does not surpass Turkey in terms of strength. Currently, Turkey and Russia are at the forefront of negotiations aimed at promoting peace in the region. Turkey has been actively involved in the Syrian civil war since it began in 2011. Turkish government supports the Free Syrian Army, which is Assad's opponent. Even Turkey, with its National Intelligence Organisation (MIT), specially trained FSA soldiers. Not only to fight Assad's army, but also to fight ISIS, which at that time was a common

¹ Appraisal of classical elements air power based on quantities of 4th generation combat aircraft in the inventories of Turkey and other regional states, drawn from International Institute for Strategic Studies, *The Military Balance 2014* (London: Routledge, 2014)

² CBNC. "Benang Merah Kenapa Turki Russia Ribut Soal Suriah" diakses 3 februari, 2020. <https://www.cnbcindonesia.com/news/20200228085330-4-141052/benang-merah-mengapa-turki-dan-rusia-ribut-suriah>

³ Google. "Foreign Policy. "NATO Plays It Cool as Russia and Turkey Grow Closer" diakses 4 februari 2020. <https://foreignpolicy.com/2016/08/10/nato-plays-it-cool-as-russia-and-turkey-grow-closer-putin-erdogan-coup/>

Turkish-Russian Cooperation in Procurement S-400 TRIUMF Missile System 2019

enemy throughout the world. Turkey's joining was not without reason. Turkey through its President Recep Tayyip Erdogan said President Assad had committed war crimes in the region bordering Turkey. Turkey's geographical location in western Asia, bordering conflict-prone countries, urges Turkey to update and strengthen its air defence system. Russian media related to Turkey clearly tells about the purchase of Russian S-400 missile systems for Turkey, with these reports Turkey does not have to rely on NATO for protection because it can turn to Russia at any time.⁴

President Erdoğan's statement on 12 June 2019, I did not say that Turkey would buy the S-400 defence system, but it has bought it. We are done with this process. We signed the contract, bought it at a suitable price and will switch the process to co-production of the S-400. Inshallah it will come soon. We should think of the Syrian crisis not in terms of S-400s and F-35s; illustrating that Turkey has made up its mind. On the same day, on Russia Day on 12 June, Russian Ambassador to Ankara Alexei Yermakov stated that he would not change Russia's stance on the S-400, Turkey and Russia have stated that they will continue to cooperate technically. The statement shows Turkey's urgent position, despite pressure from the US and NATO. It was announced that the S-400 parts would start being delivered to Turkey in mid-July 2020. The S400 only happens by agreement between Russia and Turkey and will be deployed in areas under Turkish authority. According to this, a third world country to take Turkey off the agenda of the latest debate, is not applicable. The deepening crisis between Turkey and the US, however, suggests that this system may be able to protect the Turkish Republic of Northern Cyprus as its base.⁵ Turkey's S-400 missile purchase agreement is not to create problems with NATO, but rather the vulnerability of the Turkish military in the field of air defence. Russia is an important actor in this case because with the S-400 cooperation, Turkey's foreign policy has turned closer to Russia.

The Russian leader has sought to drive the United States further away from Turkey. Putin succeeded in persuading Erdogan to buy a new Russian S-400 defense system, worth \$2.5 billion, causing discomfort in Washington, which sees the sale as a security breach within the NATO alliance. In response, the US promptly prohibited Turkey from obtaining the planned F-35 fighters. America's withdrawal from the Turkish project has forced Turkey to look for alternative arrangements, potentially leading to closer ties with Russia. The purchase is in line with President Recep Tayyip Erdogan's goal of modernising Turkey's long-range air defence, but has sparked diplomatic tensions within NATO and faced opposition from the United States.

Turkey has the status of the second largest army in NATO (North Atlantic Treaty Organisation).⁶ Turkey holds a significant and influential position in the current Middle East dynamics. As a pivotal link between Europe and the Middle East, Turkey plays an important role in attracting NATO and the European Union's attention in the field of security. Furthermore, Turkey's strategic geography, which shares borders with two unstable countries, Syria and Iraq, puts the country in a state of enduring vulnerability, subjected to the ongoing challenges and threats stemming from regional conflicts.⁷ Russia in this case has the advantage of regional problems, namely by showing its participation to maintain Turkey's security stability by supplying S-400 air defence equipment to Turkey.

The missile system is produced by the state-owned weapons manufacturer Almaz-Antey, which has faced sanctions from the European Union and the US over Russian involvement in Ukraine. Designed to respond to a variety of threats, the S-400 is capable of destroying fighter jets, cruise missiles, ballistic missiles and drones. Russian media claim that the S-400 surpasses its French or US counterparts in capacity and efficiency.⁸ With the trust of several buyer countries in the S-400 missile, Russia has the opportunity to show its existence again in the field of air defence systems. The S-400, which replaced the S-300 and S-200, was considered by the NATO alliance to be technically incompatible with the existing NATO joint defence systems. Operating Russian-made S-400s along with military equipment from other NATO countries poses a challenge, as the system's operating system differs from NATO standards. These differences raise concerns about Turkey's ability to integrate the S-400 into a joint defence structure, potentially leading to independent military capabilities beyond NATO's control. In particular, IFF (Identification Friend or Enemy) software on the S-400 may not prevent Turkey from using the system against NATO aircraft and missiles. Furthermore, achieving full operational capability will require the presence of Russian personnel in Turkey for guidance, assistance, and training.⁹ Turkey is a member of the NATO defence pact and the United States alliance. This makes Turkey get criticism from the United States of America not to cooperate with the S-400. The threats coming from the United States did not make Turkey waver to purchase the Russian-made missile. In the end, Turkey's move became the basis for the imposition of CAATSA sanctions (Countering America's Adversaries Through Sanction Act). The CAATSA is a sanction imposed on countries

⁴ Russia Today "No problem in buying Russian S-400s, Erdogan says, hints at S-500 talks" diakses februari, 2020. <https://www.rt.com/news/406552-turkey-russia-s400-s500/>;

⁵ Russia Today "Mengapa Turki Membeli S400" diakses pada 2 februari, 2020. <https://www.trt.net.tr/melayu/turki/2019/06/14/mengapa-turki-membeli-s-400-1218547>

⁶ Independent UK Caroline Mortimer, "Nato's second biggest army just bought nearly £2bn of weapons from Russia", (Independent:UK) <https://www.independent.co.uk/news/world/europe/nato-army-buys2-billion-dollars-weapons-from-russia-military-deal-a7942521.html>

⁷ Merve Seren, *Turkey's Quest for National Missile Defense System : Prospects & Challenges*, 2017, hal.13

⁸ "S-400, Rudal Super Canggih Produksi Rusia yang Buat Turki Bepaling dari AS" diakses 12 februari 2020 <https://www.dw.com/id/s-400-rudal-super-canggih-produksi-rusia-yang-buat-turki-berpaling-dari-as/a-49595340>

⁹ Mintpressnews "Turkey Under Fire For Bucking NATO Suppliers, Signing Arms Deal With Russia", diakses 14 feb 2020 <https://www.mintpressnews.com/turkey-signing-armsdeal-russia-bucking-nato/232176/>

Turkish-Russian Cooperation in Procurement S-400 TRIUMF Missile System 2019

that are members of the United States alliance in the NATO defence pact that are involved in significant transactions with agencies/entities that have been blacklisted by the United States of America in this context including anyone doing business with the Russian defence and intelligence sectors (US Gov, 2019). Indeed, Turkey's decision to buy Russian S-400 missiles is likely to have substantial implications for its diplomatic relations. On the one hand, it can strengthen relations with Russia, showing significant defence collaboration. On the other hand, it could undermine Turkish relations in the alliance, with NATO and the United States. The acquisition raises concerns about compatibility with the NATO system and could cause diplomatic tensions, given opposition from NATO allies and the US. Turkey must carefully navigate the complex geopolitical landscape to balance its strategic interests and maintain stable relations with both Russia and its traditional alliance. Despite the facts and pressure from NATO for Turkey to cancel the S-400 ballistic missile deal, Turkish president Recep Tayyip Erdogan firmly announced that the missile system was planned to be ready for use in April 2020. It can be said that this agreement made Turkey a NATO member that dared to take the decision to get closer to Russia, because the goals of the alliance were clear: deterring possible Soviet aggression, securing greater unity among Western European democracies, preventing re-nationalisation of defence, and consolidating the United States' security commitment to Europe.¹⁰ Foreign policy involves scrutinising a state's external policies and placing them within the broader context of academic knowledge.¹¹ The lack of a 'leviathan' authority over states means that states often behave in certain unpredictable ways. Some states may not appear to be threatening and peace-loving but others are aggressive and threatening. This condition results in the state implementing strategies by showing double standards, one of which is that in the midst of the continuity of the cooperation ties it is currently undergoing with country A, for example, the state actually shows an increase in the intensity of its approach with a country B, which is a rival to country A. This change is basically done to ensure the survival and security of the state. The fact that there are always countries knocking on the door of state sovereignty, makes countries sometimes change and even change their course (Robert & George Sorensen, 2013). This is related to Turkey's foreign policy to buy the S-400 because Turkey's regional environment has conditions that are quite vulnerable to conflict and Turkey's desire to strengthen its domestic air defence system, but this has created a new stigma for Turkey's foreign policy which is getting closer to Russia. The dynamics of the fluctuating relationship pattern between the two countries was shown when Turkey decided to make a procurement agreement for the Russian S-400 Missile Weapon. Turkey's joining in the purchase of Russian S-400 Missiles will have a lot of influence on the relationship between Turkey and Russia as well as its relationship with the alliance. This research will try to explain the reasons for Turkey's purchase of Russian S-400 Missiles by using several International Relations theories, namely National Interest, Geopolitics, International Politics, and Balance of Threat. The author tries to describe in general how the correlation between the above theories with the dynamics of the agreement to procure the Russian S-400 Missile System by Turkey and some of the impacts that occur with the cooperation. Further analysis will be discussed in this study by explaining Turkey's factors in purchasing S-400 missiles.

II. LITERATURE REVIEW

Research conducted by Omi Ngabekti entitled "The Cooperation between Turkey and Russia in Procuring the S-400 Missile Air Defence System in 2017" explains Turkey's desire to be able to maintain its domestic security stability with Russia as its business partner. In addition, research conducted by Hatta Zailiyus entitled "Dynamics of Turkey Russia Relations After the Shooting of Sukhoi 24". The research shows more how the common interest in eradicating terrorism in the region is one of the factors that makes the two countries cooperate after the improvement of relations between the two countries. The purpose of this is to further strengthen diplomatic relations between countries and avoid conflicts that previously occurred. As for the writing in this research, it is more to emphasise what is the reason for the Turkey's desire to purchase Russia's S-400.

III. METHODS

The research uses descriptive qualitative research methodologies, based on literature review methods taken from various sources such as books, journals, photos, and news articles. The theories used in this research are Geopolitics, National Interest, International Politics and Balance of Threat (BoT) theories.

IV. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

A. Turkey's Strength in Security and Military.

The Turkish military is recognized as one of the most outstanding powers globally, holding the ninth position in the world rankings. It boasts a fairly large arsenal, including 3,200 combat tanks, and a large personnel force of 735,000 men.¹² Turkey's

¹⁰ Mata-Mata Politik "Bersikeras Membeli S-400 Rusia, Saatnya Turki Keluar dari Aliansi Barat" diakses 16 februarri 2020 <https://www.matamatapolitik.com/polling-opini-ini-saatnya-usir-turki-dari-aliansi-barat/>

¹¹ Penterjemah :Dadan, Pancasari. *Introduction to International Relations, fifth edition* New York Oxford: University Press Inc, 2013.

¹² https://www.globalfirepower.com/country-military-strength-detail.asp?country_id=turkey

Turkish-Russian Cooperation in Procurement S-400 TRIUMF Missile System 2019

military also ranks as one of the most powerful militaries in the Middle East region according to Forbes.¹³ Turkey has a population of 81,257,239 and has a military membership of 735,000 with 355,000 active personnel and 380,000 reserve personnel. The Turkish military is divided into three sectors, namely the air force (AU) with a total asset of 87 air military transports, with 429 helicopters and 94 of them are attack helicopters. Turkish military weapons consist of products produced and developed by its domestic company, Turkish Aerospace Industry. The company is actively involved in the continuous advancement of the aerospace industry and is also making efforts to place itself in the field of space exploration. Turkish Aerospace aspires to significant goals with its unique products, striving to build itself as a leader in the aviation industry.¹⁴ and army (Army), has 3.2 thousand battle tanks, 9.5 thousand ground military vehicles, 1.1 thousand automatic artillery pieces, and 1.2 thousand manual artillery pieces. The Turkish Army has 350 rocket projectors,¹⁵ launches every tool of Turkey's defence system. Most of the equipment and transport in the army are domestically made, such as main battle tanks (MBTs), medium tanks, Mine-Resistant, Ambush-Protected (MRAP) (war vehicles), and Armoured Combat Vehicles (ACVs) (manned war vehicles) (Navy). The Turkish navy has a force with a total of 194 assets, consisting of 16 frigates, 10 corvettes, 12 submarines, 34 patrol boats, and 11 war bases. Turkish Air Force military transports and equipment are domestically made from 1868 to 2023 frigates, amphibious assault transports, anti-submarine warfare (ASW) corvettes, diesel-electrical attack submarines, and mine countermeasures vessels.¹⁶

However, the 1991 Gulf War served as a wake-up call for Turkey. Fortunately, Turkish territory was not targeted by Iraqi Scud missiles, and a potential threat from the chemical weapons head was avoided. However, the conflict revealed significant shortcomings in Turkey's modern air defence capabilities and highlighted Turkish uncertainty in the face of the threat of ballistic missiles. In response to Turkey's urgent request, NATO allies have distributed several Patriot Surface-to-Air Missile (SAM) batteries to strengthen the country's basic defence capabilities. Despite this aid, the controversy and differences between NATO allies during this expansion raised serious doubts among Turkish military planners and the general public.¹⁷ Next, we discuss Turkey's military capabilities in 2012, which were enough to be a consideration in shaping the policy of requesting NATO patriot missiles on the Turkish-Syrian border.¹⁸ In terms of patriot missiles which are air attack deterrents, we need to look at Turkey's air power, where Turkey has 989 aircraft of which 254 are interceptor fighters and 437 are transport aircraft, Turkey also has 418 helicopters 36 of which are attack helicopters.¹⁹ It is worth looking at the strength of Turkey's army equipment, given that there is a large land border between Turkey and Syria. Turkey has 3,657 tanks, 8,532 APCs (Armoured Personnel Carriers) and IFVs (Infantry Fighting Vehicles), 2,152 Towed Artillery and 646 Multiple-Launch Rocket Systems²⁰ Turkey's military strength according to Global Fire Power data ranks eighth strongest in the world. After seeing that Turkey's military strength is quite strong and even ranks eighth in the world,²¹ according to Global Fire Power.²² A strong military must be supported with a strong budget, in order to create a good development in the military field. Especially with Turkey's plan to develop its own patriot missile, of course the development of patriot missiles itself requires a lot of funds. The strength of the Turkish military industry focuses only on land artillery, and still has shortcomings in air defence systems, therefore Turkey continues to try to increase strength in air defence. This is what made Turkey agree to purchase the S-400 Triumph Missile system. The agreement that has been established by Turkey and Russia for the purchase of the S-400 Missile is one clear evidence of Turkey's seriousness in improving air defence strength. Furthermore, it discusses the Turkish military industry which makes Turkey one of the strongest countries in the military field in Eastern Europe. Turkey has a defence industry that focuses on the manufacture of armoured combat vehicles called FNSS. FNSS in 2014 collaborated with PT Pindad Indonesia. The Indonesian government is collaborating with the Turkish government to make medium-sized battle tanks. The cooperation is contained in a memorandum of understanding that was carried out at the Indo Defence 2014 main weaponry system exhibition at the Jakarta International Expo Kemayoran, Friday, 7 November 2014.²³ Turkey's quest for military independence was manifested in the initiation of the HISAM (Turkish surface-to-air missile system) project in 2007. In this initiative, Turkey has issued requests for information to domestic and international defence companies to deal with requirements for short and medium-range air protection. Finally, ASELSAN, the military company under the control of the Turkish authorities, emerged as the main contractor, working with ROKESTAN, a Turkish weapons producer and defence contracting, in the implementation of the project. (Daily Sabah, 2018).

The defence industry has emerged as an important sector that contributes significantly to Turkish income growth. This is evident from the tremendous increase in total Turkish exports in the defence and aviation industries. According to the Turkish

¹³ <https://www.forbes.com/sites/dominicdudley/2018/02/26/ten-strongest-military-forces-middle-east/#e8a0d3216a24>

¹⁴ <https://www.tusas.com/en/>

¹⁵ <https://tirto.id/militer-turki-2019-terkuat-ke-9-dunia-dengan-3200-tank-perang-eg9q>

¹⁶ <https://www.militaryfactory.com/armor/by-country.asp?Nation=Turkey>

¹⁷ Serhat Güvenç and Sıtkı Egeli, "NATO'nun füze savunma sistemi ve Türkiye," *Ortadoğu Analiz* 40 (2014): 22.

¹⁸ William D. Coplin. *Introduce to Internastional Politics*. Op.Cit., Hal. 167

¹⁹ Diakses dari http://globalfirepower.com/country-military-strength-detail.asp?country_id=turkey . Pada tanggal 28 november 2020

²⁰ Ibid.

²¹ Ibid.

²² Diakses dari http://globalfirepower.com/country-military-strength-detail.asp?country_id=turkey

²³ <https://www.pindad.com/indonesia-turki-sepakati-produksi-tank-medium->

Turkish-Russian Cooperation in Procurement S-400 TRIUMF Missile System 2019

Exporters Association (TIM), there was an export growth of 9.3% in the 2017-2018 period, followed by a remarkable increase of 64.4% in the 2018-2019 period. (Turkish Exporters Assembly, 2019). It underscores Turkey's commitment to advancing its domestic industry, especially in the aviation sector, as demonstrated by its successful export efforts.

To meet Turkey's need for long-range missile defence systems, the country has begun the 'Siper' program, which is scheduled to be completed in 2021. (Defense News, 2018). Responsibility for developing the program has been entrusted to three Turkish national companies: ROCKETSAN, ASELSAN, and TUBITAK SAGE, emphasizing Turkey's dedication to enhancing defence capabilities through domestic initiatives.

B. Russia's Strength in Security and Military.

Militarily, Russia is far ahead of Turkey in terms of land, sea and air power. Russia is also one of the countries with the strongest military in the world. Russia has a domestic combat equipment industry called VPK, which conducts research on existing industrial resources and materials, and has highly qualified personnel to meet the demands of domestic and foreign arms markets, helping clients achieve their targets.²⁴ It is true that the Soviet military-industrial complex, represented by the VPK (Voyenno-promyshlennaya kompaniya VPK), played an important role in making the USSR a military superpower. After the collapse of the Soviet Union, there were significant challenges in terms of economic chaos and arms production. However, Russia, as a successor to the Soviet Union, has managed to maintain and optimize the defence industry. Currently, the Russian defence agency VPK continues to operate effectively under the supervision of the Russian government. Russians substantial military strength, with 766.055 active troops and a significant reserve force of 2.48 million. It underlines Russia's commitment to strong defence capabilities.

Global Firepower tracks the annual defence spending budget of each participant in the GFP ranking, these are the funds officially allocated by the respective governments to maintain and strengthen standing combat power. As not all countries have the luxury of large budgets, some are forced to maintain affiliations and alliances with regional or global neighbours for security. Russia is recorded to have allocated USD 48 billion in government funds for defence²⁵ Such a large military budget is used for military defence and the manufacture of domestic equipment, one of which is the production of air defence systems that have several generations, one of which is the S-300 missile. The S-300 missile is a product developed by the Russian government together with the domestic defence industry Almaz-Antey.

Established in 2002 by Presidential Decree and Government Decree of the Russian Federation, Almaz-Antey Corporation is a conglomerate of a number of companies dedicated to the development and production of short, medium and long-range anti-aircraft missile systems, as well as major radar surveillance systems and automatic control systems. This consolidation includes various entities such as factories, research and production associations, design offices, and research institutes.

The formation of the Corporation marked a significant foundation, becoming the first major corporation to be formed under the Federal Target Program "Reform and Development of the Complex Defence Industry (2002-2006)." He played a pioneering role in solving problems of the corporate management system and building equity capital. The integrated structure was initially headed by the Assistant President of the Russian Federation VP Ivanov until 2008, followed by Deputy Chief of Administration of the President of Russia AD Beglov from 2008 to 2011, VF Medovnikov from 2011 to 2014, and Executive Manager of the State Company "Rostec" SV Chemezov from 2014 to 2016.²⁶

The S-300 is a series of Russian-made ground-to-air (SAM) missile systems designed to involve aircraft, UAVs, and provide limited defence against combat missiles and ballistic missiles. The S-300 P variant, known as the SA-10 Grumble, originated from the Soviet Union's development efforts in the 1960s and 1970s, mainly for air defence purposes. Derivatives of the S-300 P are the S-300-V, also known as the SA-23A Gladiator and SA-23B Giant, equipped with anti-ballistic missile capabilities. In some respects, it has similarities to the US Patriot Advanced Capability-2 (PAC-2).²⁷ The S-300 has a successor series called the S-400 Triumf which is the target product of various countries in the world, such as Turkey which has purchased the S-400 series. The S-400 Triumf, designated as the SA-21 Growler by NATO, stands as the latest surface-to-air medium and long-range missile system manufactured by Almaz-Antey. This advanced missile system was introduced into Russian military service in 2007. The main purpose of the S-400 Triumf is to neutralize aircraft, ships, and ballistic missiles. Besides, he has the ability to involve ground installations. With an impressive range, the S-400 Triumf can target objects at a distance of up to 400 km and a height of 30 km.²⁸

C. Diplomatic Relations between Turkey and Russia in 2016-2017.

Relations between countries in the era of globalisation cannot be avoided, because countries need other countries to meet their needs and establish cooperation in certain fields according to the interests of each country. Relations between countries are

²⁴ <https://www.army-technology.com/contractors/vehicles/ooo-vpk/>

²⁵ <https://www.globalfirepower.com/defense-spending-budget.asp>

²⁶ <http://www.almaz-antey.ru/en/istoriya/>

²⁷ <https://missilethreat.csis.org/defsys/s-300/>

²⁸ <https://internasional.kontan.co.id/news/terima-dua-set-resimen-s-400-triumf-sistem-pertahanan-udara-rusia-makin-kuat>

Turkish-Russian Cooperation in Procurement S-400 TRIUMF Missile System 2019

expected to mutually benefit all parties involved in the relationship. Relations between countries can be carried out in various ways, one of which is by opening diplomatic relations.²⁹ Diplomacy, as defined, includes actions and interactions carried out by government officials in the context of negotiations and relations between nations. It involves the art and science to manage these negotiations, which require skills in dealing with individuals to minimize or prevent evil actions. Basically, diplomacy is a diverse practice that involves strategic communication, negotiation, and relations management on the international stage to promote cooperation and prevent conflict between nations. If a country has agreed to the opening of diplomatic relations with another country through an instrument on the basis of the principle of reciprocity and the principle of mutual consent, these countries must already think about opening a diplomatic representation and the arrangement of the membership of the representation both in its level and the number of staff members of the representative who have been mutually agreed on the basis of fairness and appropriateness.³⁰ When discussing diplomatic relations between two countries, it is inseparable from the goals and interests that must be achieved by both parties, such as the arrival of Turkish leader President Erdogan to Moscow Russia to discuss the continuation of the S400 missile purchase agreement that was approved by both parties in September 2017. After arriving in Moscow, Turkish President Recep Tayyip Erdogan was treated to an aerial fighter parade, where Russian President Vladimir Putin wanted to showcase his latest military technology to President Erdogan.³¹

Around 2009, Turkish President Abdullah Gul visited Russia to meet with President Dimitry Medvedev who replaced Putin at the time, which was one of the reasons for the significant changes between the two countries in 2009. Abdullah Gul's visit influenced their bilateral relations and increased co-operation in all fields to a more strategic level. On 20 December 2016, the three countries' Foreign and Defence Ministers met in Moscow to discuss a peaceful settlement in Syria. The statement reflects the positions of Iranian Foreign Minister Mohammed Javad Zarif, Russian Foreign Secretary Sergey Lavrov, and Turkish Minister of Foreign Affairs Mevlut Cavusoglu regarding the settlement of the Syrian conflict. They expressed their intention to end the conflict without the direct involvement of the United States and Britain. Lavrov stressed that the participating parties, Iran, Russia, and Turkey, are considered to have significant influence in Syria, which implies that their involvement is essential for effective negotiations and resolutions, while undermining the role of Britain and the United States in this particular context. (Hubbard, 2016).³²

Indeed, relations between Russia and Turkey have undergone remarkable developments, marking a new chapter in their diplomatic relations. Both countries have taken measures that have significant implications for their common interests. This growing relationship has witnessed diplomatic, economic, and geopolitical movements that reflect a shift in dynamics and priorities between Russia and Turkey. The steps taken by these countries could cover a wide range of areas, including trade agreements, cooperation on regional issues, and joint initiatives that shape their strategic partnerships. Russia, which has long played a role in combating terrorism, especially in the Syrian region, while also supporting the continuation of the Bashar Al Asad regime, feels the need to cooperate with Turkey, which on the other hand is experiencing poor relations with the US and the European Union. So improving relations will be very easy to achieve, apart from the fact that Turkey is a country close to Syria, Turkey is also a major country in the region that also fights against terrorist groups and separatists in the region. However, Turkey's interests in Syria are different from Russia's in that Turkey supports the ouster of Bashar Al Asad from power, with cooperation between the two countries, it is hoped that the incident that occurred in the past, namely the shooting down of Russian military aircraft by Turkey, will not be repeated.

In September 2017, an important step in Russian-Turkish relations was the initiation of a cooperation agreement for the purchase of the S-400 air defence missile weapons system from Russia. This decision marks a strategic step by Turkey to acquire advanced military capabilities, and has broader implications for the geopolitical landscape in the region. The S-400 deal sparked debate and concern among Turkish NATO allies, the United States, about interoperability issues and security implications. The deal underscores the growing dynamics in Russian-Turkish relations and their desire to engage in defence collaboration.³³ A quote from Hurriyet Daily News highlighted Turkish President Recep Tayyip Erdogan's announcement of an agreement between Ankara and Moscow for the purchase of high-tech defence equipment. Erdogan specifically mentioned the signing of an agreement for the acquisition of the Russian S-400 defence system. The statement underscores the determination of Russian and Turkish presidents to move forward with the purchase agreement, marking a commitment to cooperation in the defence sector. This announcement, made on September 10, 2017, highlights the importance of defence cooperation between Russia and Turkey during that period.³⁴ The statement suggests that Russia may find a suitable environment for cooperation with Turkey because of the tense relations between Turkey and the United States. As diplomatic relations between Turkey and the United States deteriorate, it creates a situation where Russia may see an opening to enhancing cooperation with Turkey. Geopolitical dynamics often play a role in forming alliances and partnerships between countries, and in this context, the deterioration of relations between Turkey and the

²⁹ Sumaryo Suryokusumo, *Hukum Diplomatik Dan Konsuler* Jilid I, (Jakarta: Tatanusa, 2013), hal.3.

³⁰ *Ibid.* hal.53

³¹ <https://www.liputan6.com/global/read/4048607/bertemu-vladimir-putin-di-rusia-presiden-turki-singgung-soal-suriah>

³² *Jurnal Dinamika Pemerintahan* Vol.3, No. 1 hal. 34

³³ <https://international.sindonews.com/berita/1419212/43/erdogan-turki-gunakan-sistem-rudal-s-400-rusia-jika-diserang>

³⁴ *Journal of Strategic and Global Studies* | Volume 3, Number 1, January 2020

Turkish-Russian Cooperation in Procurement S-400 TRIUMF Missile System 2019

United States potentially creates a favourable environment for enhanced cooperation between Russia and Turkey. The dynamics of international relations are complex, and various factors, including political, economic, and security considerations, contribute to the decisions made by countries in forming alliances and partnerships. Turkey's external factors, which concentrate on suppressing separatist movements in Syria, make it aware that Russia's assertive attitude while participating in military operations in Syria is considered a threat to Turkey.

D. Russia – Turkey Advantage in Military and Security.

This description highlights Russia's status as a major global power, especially its power in the fields of energy, security, and military capabilities. The historical role of Russia as the Soviet Union, a remarkable, recognised world power, and continued efforts to modernize its military power, both conventional and nuclear, were emphasized. This information indicates that Russia is actively working to upgrade its nuclear arsenal, with the aim of eliminating Soviet-era missiles and carriers by 2024. References to the site Strategic Nuclear Weapons of Russia provide specific details about the number of strategic ships deployed and potential nuclear warheads. It is important to note that perspectives on Russia's global influence and military capabilities can vary, and geopolitical dynamics can change over time. Moreover, the information provided reflects a certain time (early 2020), and developments in global affairs may have occurred since then.

This analysis gives a clear picture of the relationship between a country's military power and its political leadership, focusing on Russia and its President, Vladimir Putin. It acknowledges the ongoing evolution in the Russian military structure, emphasizing the shift towards a higher percentage of professional contract personnel. New shield vehicles such as T-14 Armata tanks and Kurganets infantry combat vehicles show emphasis on defence capabilities. In addition, the information highlights changes in Russian military tactics, with attempts to distribute smaller and more flexible brigades and battalion tactical groups compared to larger Cold War divisions. The pace of Russian military modernization, however, is recorded as dependent on the economic development of the country. The economic aspect was emphasized, with discussions of the 2020 re-alignment programme initially based on growth expectations. Economic stagnation, however, led to increased military spending, postponing new weapons programmes until 2025. This view emphasizes the influence of economic factors on a country's military capabilities and modernization efforts.³⁵ Russia, which has many advanced technologies in the field of air defence, has become a producer and importer to various countries in the world, one of which Turkey is a buyer of the S-400 missile system due to technological deficiencies and ambitions to strengthen air defence.

CONCLUSIONS

Turkey's decision to purchase Russian missiles is actually considered a unilateral action that violates the agreement with its alliance the United States. This decision will basically only question Turkey's membership position in the NATO defence pact which exacerbates Turkey's potential in NATO and the potential for the threat of CAATSA sanctions by the United States. The analysis suggests that Turkey's decision to buy Russian S-400 missiles was driven by high-risk considerations, and identified Russia's ongoing aggressive actions as a motivating factor behind this choice. The purchase of the S-400 missile was described as a strategic response aimed at reducing or minimizing the threat perceived by Russia. Several factors contributed to Turkey's perception of Russian threats, including Russia's extraordinary military power and the geographical proximity of the two countries. Strong Russian military recognition is in line with global awareness of Russia's capabilities. Furthermore, proximity between Turkey and Russia has been identified as a factor influencing Turkey's decision to build a new partnership with Russia.

The historical context is also mentioned, with the 2016 incident involving the shooting of a Russian fighter aircraft by Turkey serving as a reference point. The dynamics of bilateral relations between Turkey and Russia are presented as growing and interesting, reflecting the complexity of their interactions over time. Overall, the analysis suggests that Turkey's purchase of S-400 missiles is a response to perceived security concerns related to Russian military actions and capabilities. The offensive capabilities through Russia's aggressiveness in the region and Russia's offensive intentions outside its territory that turned out to be able to surprise Turkey. Turkey's geographical position near a large country that annually conducts massive weapons development and actively conducts massive military campaigns, and Russia's offensive policy in Syria aimed at Turkey is very real. In this case, the purchase of S-400 missiles is an offer in the military field from Russia to correct mistakes made by Turkey such as the shooting down of the SU-24 aircraft, the Kurdish problem in Syria, the Caspian Sea territory and various other conflicts that threaten Turkey's existence in the international world.

ACKNOWLEDGMENT

We sincerely thank to International Relations Department of Universitas Nasional and Universitas Pertahanan Republik Indonesia for all the forms of support to me on this research. As a result, this research can be finished nicely.

³⁵ Julian Cooper, "Russia's State Armament Program to 2020: A Quantitative Assessment of Implementation, 2011-2015

REFERENCES

- 1) Egeli, Sıtkı. "Making Sense of Turkey's Air and Missile Defense Merry-go-round." *All Azimuth: A Journal of Foreign Policy & Peace* 8, no. 1 (2019).
- 2) Robert Jackson, George Sorensen. *Pengantar Hubungan Internasional Teori dan Pendekatan Edisi Kelima: Introduction to International Relations*, fifth edition Oxford University Press Inc, New York, 2013.
- 3) Anak Agung Banyu Perwita, Yanyan Mochammad Yani. *Pengantar Ilmu Hubungan Internasional*, Bandung: PT Remaja Rosdakarya, 2014.
- 4) T.A. Coulombis dan J.H. Wolfe. *Introduction to International Relations: Prentice-Hall*, 1986. Miriam Budiarjo *Dasar-Dasar Ilmu politik Edisi Revisi*. Jakarta: PT Gramedia, 2019.
- 5) J. A. Rosenau, Gavin Boyd, dan Kenneth W. Thompson. *World Politics: An Introduction*. New York: The Free Press, 1976.
- 6) J.C Johari. *International Relations and Politics: Theoretical Perspective*. New Delhi: Sterling Publisher, 1985.
- 7) Merve Seren. *Turkey's Quest for National Missile Defense System : Prospects & Challenges*, 2017.
- 8) Foreign Policy. "NATO Plays It Cool as Russia and Turkey Grow Closer" diakses 4 februari 2020. <https://foreignpolicy.com/2016/08/10/nato-plays-it-cool-as-russia-and-turkey-grow-closer-putin-erdogan-coup/>
- 9) CNBC. "Benang Merah Kenapa Turki Russia Ribut Soal Suriah" diakses 3 februari, 2020. <https://www.cnbcindonesia.com/news/20200228085330-4-141052/benang-merah-mengapa-turki-dan-rusia-ribut-suriah>
- 10) Russia Today "Mengapa Turki Membeli S400" diakses pada 2 februari, 2020.
- 11) <https://www.trt.net.tr/melayu/turki/2019/06/14/mengapa-turki-membeli-s-400-1218547>
- 12) Independent Uk Caroline Mortimen. "Nato's second biggest army just bought nearly £2bn of weapons from Russia", <https://www.independent.co.uk/news/world/europe/nato-army-buys2-billion-dollars-weapons-from-russia-military-deal-a7942521.html>
- 13) Wall Street Journal "In Russia-Turkey Pact, Putin Wields His Geopolitical Skills Anew" diakses 5 februari, 2020. <https://www.wsj.com/articles/in-russia-turkey-pact-putin-wields-his-geopolitical-skills-anew-11571850215>
- 14) International Institute For Strategic Studies "Turkey, the S-400 and the F-35" diakses 8 februari, 2020. <https://www.iiss.org/publications/strategic-comments/2019/turkey-the-s400-and-the-f35>
- 15) Missile Threat CSIS Missile Defense Project "S-400 Triumph" diakses 9 februari 2020. <https://missilethreat.csis.org/defsys/s-400-triumf/>
- 16) Mintpressnews "Turkey Under Fire For Bucking NATO Suppliers, Signing Arms Deal With Russia", diakses 14 feb 2020 <https://www.mintpressnews.com/turkey-signing-armsdeal-russia-bucking-nato/232176/>
- 17) Yogy, Yonathan, and Ida Kurnia. "TANGGUNG JAWAB NEGARA TERHADAP PERLINDUNGAN PEJABAT DIPLOMATIK MENURUT KONVENSI WINA 1961 (CONTOH KASUS PENYERANGAN DUTA BESAR RUSIA DI TURKI)." *Jurnal Hukum Adigama* 1, no. 1 (2018): 1237-1261.
- 18) Nugraha, Harga, R. Djoko Andreas Navalino, and Jupriyanto Jupriyanto. "ANALISIS SYSTEM REQUIREMENT MISIL JARAK SEDANG SISTEM PERTAHANAN UDARA UNTUK PENGAMANAN OBJEK VITAL NASIONAL (STUDI KASUS KOSEKHANDUDNAS I)." *Teknologi Peralatan* 1, no. 2 (2020).
- 19) Jamila, Maryam, Chendika Yonanda, Zulkifli Harza, and Ilman Syarif Masri. "Factors Supporting Turkey's Policy to Purchase Russian S-400 Anti-Air Strike Defense Units." *Journal of Strategic and Global Studies* 3, no. 1 (2020): 3.
- 20) Sos, Fatmawati S. "PERUBAHAN POLITIK LUAR NEGERI RUSIA TERHADAP SURIAH DALAM KONFLIK INTERNAL SURIAH (2011–2017)." *JDP (JURNAL DINAMIKA PEMERINTAHAN)* 3, no. 1 (2020): 23-41.
- 21) Andi Rafael Saputra. "DARI UNI SOVIET HINGGA RUSIA SEJARAH PANJANG PARA AKTOR POLITIK SERTA PERANG DINGIN RUSIA SMAPAI SEKARANG" JOGJAKARTA 2014.
- 22) Wicaksono, Tresno, and Anak Agung Banyu Perwita. "The Military Industrial Complex In a Developing Country: Lessons from the Republic of Turkey." *Jurnal Hubungan Internasional* 9.1 (2020): 53-67.
- 23) Oppenheim, Felix E. 1987. *National Interest, Rationality, and Morality*. *Political Theory*, Vol. 15, No. 3:369-389



There is an Open Access article, distributed under the term of the Creative Commons Attribution – Non Commercial 4.0 International (CC BY-NC 4.0) (<https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>), which permits remixing, adapting and building upon the work for non-commercial use, provided the original work is properly cited.