The Overlapping Truth: Exploring the Lived Experiences of Graduate Students in Research Writing

Marisa B. Petalla

University of Negros Occidental- Recoletos, Bacolod City

ABSTRACT: As the apex of the educational system, graduate education is one of the most effective means of developing capacities related to research that will improve educational theory and practice in the many different aspects of the educational process and of life in general. Utilizing a qualitative research design, this study used the phenomenological approach to explore the meaning of the experiences in research writing among graduate students. The data were collected from the participants using the focus group discussion with three groups of 6 members each. These participants are students officially enrolled in a research writing course. The researcher used an unstructured in-depth interview in gathering data and observing the iterative process until the researcher reached the saturation point, that is, no new insights can be developed from the participants. The data explication was done using Lichtman's (2013) three Cs: coding, categorizing, and forming concepts. The study revealed that research writing requires one's experiences and continuous practice with self-concept and motivation. The participants believe on the importance of the past including the knowledge gained in their previous experiences, considering the untaught skills, and their wrong perceptions about research. The influence of teachers is also seen to be significant in their experiences including teachers' motivation, approaches, and quality instruction. Self-concept also plays an important role in the experiences of the participants, including their attitude, interest, self-direction, and confidence, and being able to overcome conflict.

KEYWORDS: Research writing, Graduate education, Graduate students, Qualitative research, Bacolod City, Philippines

1.0 INTRODUCTION

Knowledge and innovative competence are becoming increasingly important in society (Onderwijsraad, 2014; Rijksoverheid, 2015). This is consequently changing the demands that are imposed on professionals. Routine skills are becoming less important, while non-routine and cross-disciplinary competencies are important (Mishra & Kereluik, 2011). Analytical, investigative, and reflective competencies may serve as examples of this. For researchers, such qualities are also important for optimal performance to improve responsiveness, innovation, and productivity in research (Onderwijsraad, 2014). Furthermore, research plays a significant role in our daily life. All inventions in medicine and technology have been possible with the help of research (Gross, 2001; Chen et al., 2015).

Research aims for better knowledge that can improve the quality of life (Hinkka et al., 2002; Cozzens, 2010), contribute to understanding the phenomenon, and communicate that understanding to others (Wilson, 2008; Mohajan, 2018). This makes research a core business of universities globally and is crucial in the scientific process as a precursor for knowledge uptake and use (Obuku et al., 2017). Relatedly, research is also considered the essence of graduate education. As the apex of the educational system, graduate education is also one of the most effective means of developing capacities related to research that will improve educational theory and practice in the many different aspects of the educational process (Rogers et al., 2010).

Moreover, the Commission on Higher Education (CHED) mandates to inspire and enable Philippine Higher Education Institutions (HEIs) to become platforms for research and development, innovation, and extension in pursuit of inclusive social and economic development (Philippine Republic Act No. 7722). In this context, HEIs play a crucial role in developing the right knowledge, skills, and attitudes in research among graduate students. In fact, CHED recognizes research as the lifeblood of Higher Education. In addition, it is also a research advocacy in higher education through the Philippine Association of Graduate Education (PAGE), as stated in the National Higher Education Research Agenda (NHERA), to develop a responsive culture and environment for research in Philippine Higher Education (CMO 21, series of 1999) to develop research capacity to build a quality nation capable of transcending the social, political, economic, cultural, and ethical issues that constrain the country's human development, productivity, and global competitiveness (CMO 46, series of 2012).

More so, research gives rewarding learning experiences for students, producing graduates capable of high personal and professional achievement (Wilson, 2008; Shaukat et al., 2014). Thus, colleges and universities worldwide play a vital role as

higher education providers whose graduates possess the academic and professional qualifications that are responsive to the requirements and challenges related to the globalization of societies, economy, and labor markets (Madrigal, 2015). However, as observed in the classroom, research has been a problem. Many students indicated that they lacked research preparation upon beginning graduate study and during the first year of study, lacked development in important research skills like statistics and communicating in writing, and were somewhat hindered in research organization and progress (Rogers et al., 2010).

Similar studies were conducted on research competence as support to evidence-based practice among nursing students (Burke, 2005), the use of project-based teaching technology (Urinova & Abdullaeva, 2021), among undergraduate students through hands-on learning (Davidson & Palermo, 2015), and among students trained in Mathematical direction (Yarullin et al., 2015). However, very limited were conducted on the lived experiences of graduate students in research writing. Thus, the paper was conducted to fill in the gap in the literature.

This paper aimed to explore and describe the lived experience of graduate students at a Catholic university in research writing.

2.0 METHODOLOGY

Utilizing a qualitative research design, this study used the phenomenological approach to explore the meaning of the experiences in research writing among graduate students (Lichtman, 2014). Phenomenology is an inductive descriptive method that aims to describe participants' lived experiences (phenomena) in an attempt to draw out their meaning (Lichtman, 2014). The data were collected from the participants with three groups of 6 members each. These participants are students officially enrolled in a research writing course. Focus group discussion was utilized in the data gathering. FGD provides speedy results, simultaneously covering a variety of ideas, opinions, experiences, needs, evaluations, or concerns from a group of participants (Lichtman, 2010). The researcher used an unstructured in-depth interview with a primary question focusing on the participants' experiences in writing their research papers. The rest of the questions are probing questions depending on the participant's responses. The iterative process was observed during the focus group discussion until the researcher reached the saturation point, that is, no new insights can be developed from the participants. The data explication was done using Lichtman's (2013) three Cs: coding, categorizing, and forming concepts.

3.0 RESULTS

From the narratives of the participants on their lived experiences in research writing, the following themes and sub-themes were culled out.

The Importance of the Past. When compared to education with children, adolescents, and students, graduate education has opportunities and challenges, depending on stronger biographical influences: adults have developed their own learning style and learning competence, and apart from more formal learning opportunities facilitated through digital learning and/ or learning in schools/ universities, there are many opportunities for informal learning, often influenced by experiences of education in the past. In this regard, learning offers opportunities for transformation, organic, remembrance, and experiences (Franzenburg, 2017). Although past experiences can take many forms, all experiences (e.g., planned, incidental) can be associated with practitioners' learning (Cousins, 1998). Virany et al. (1996) even argue that learning occurs only after gaining experience. Actions, even mistakes, provide new information that forms the basis for learning. Therefore, examining past events (retrospective reviews) is essential in fostering learning.

Prior knowledge serves as the foundation of quality research. Fundamental knowledge is required for a researcher to be properly guided in the conduct of research. A higher level of research will be achieved once a researcher is grounded in sufficient concepts and knowledge. Students at the graduate level are expected to acquire the foundation of knowledge at the undergraduate level, which will only be enriched at the higher level of education. It is well known that students build on what they know. The absence or presence of prior knowledge may hinder or promote their learning. The narratives of the participants were,

So, if you have no prior knowledge of research, you will definitely find it difficult to do research. Based on my experience, it depends on your foundation in your earlier years of education, whether at the secondary or tertiary level.

Research at the master's level is supposed to be further studies for us. But in our case, it was more of going back from scratch, going from the basics, because we were not prepared for this at a higher level. It is as if we are still beginners in the field. We lack knowledge, and we lack the skills on how to do it.

Untaught skills cause unpreparedness. Research is to be done systematically and scientifically. This can only be made possible if students are exposed to different research skills, which will prepare them to research independently. Deprivation of skills or the absence of opportunities for development may cause lasting effects on students. This might cause negative outcomes for the opportunities that these students will have in research. Continuous research skills development might also be adversely affected. The participants shared,

The Overlapping Truth: Exploring the Lived Experiences of Graduate Students in Research Writing

> *When I was still in college, we did not get to the point that we did it step by step or point by point. We were just instructed that we would conduct research, and that is it. We were left with tons of work to do and without even having any idea of what to do next.*
>
> *We were not even guided on how to do it or what to consider in choosing the titles. That was very difficult for me and very confusing at the same time. It is even funny when we submit a wrong output and are just instructed to revise without being told what part to revise and how we can do it. We were not given the proper explanation as to why it is considered wrong. We were just told that we must find out what to revise.*

Previous experience serves as the best teacher. Experiences in the past would always be considered the best teacher for they contribute to understanding the present situation, especially in decision-making and problem-solving. The learning experiences the students underwent in the past will stimulate them to continue their passion for learning in the present and even in the future. However, bad experiences in the past would surely affect the present perception and even the attitudes of the students in terms of research. Thus, rich experiences must be provided to students so they are ready to acquire new skills. The participants expressed,

> *Because of my experience, I tried my best to learn the things that my teacher before should have taught us in the first place. With this, my students now will never experience what we experienced before. Knowing that I struggled a lot in college, I see to it that each element must be learned by my students.*
>
> *I am positive about research. I am interested in research because of my learning experiences in my college years.*

Wrong perception creates confusion. The research arena is the haven for wrong perceptions. If this kind of perception is not corrected, it can lead to the destruction of students. A negative attitude towards research is mainly caused by mistaken views in the field caused by improper orientation. These faulty perceptions were also caused by their past experiences that gave them unconstructive memories of what research is. Fear is also one possible effect of a negative impression of research. As most of them expressed,

> *My first impression of research is "it is a struggle" (laughing). Before, research for me would entail sleepless nights (laughing). We find research to be very heavy work for us. It requires a heavy load of work and more thinking.*
>
> *I am always thinking that when you defend your thesis, you will be "grilled" by the panel members. But once you are there, it differs from what other students would tell you. That is what other people would tell us. That is why we also think the same way. Feedback from other people would really affect you, and you will think of negative things instead of becoming strong and confident.*
>
> *My idea of research when I first entered this class was difficult because it was the first time I had heard a real discussion of what research really is.*

The Influence of Teachers. The unique role that teachers play relative to students and the kinds of experiences that teachers create for students suggest that teachers may exert a powerful influence on whether students like school. Since attachment to school has been shown to affect students' learning and academic performance, identifying the characteristics of teachers that have a positive effect on students' feelings about school is very significant (Hallinan, 2008; Petalla & Madrigal, 2017; Malagsic et al., 2021; Buenacosa & Petalla, 2022). More so, teachers could affect learning in larger contexts more effectively by inspiring students. Inspiration refers to the stimulating influence that teachers have on students. Teachers' inspiration positively influences students (Van, 2012; Petalla & Doromal, 2021).

Teacher's motivation opens opportunities. Motivation is an essential process of effective teaching. As the key persons in the classroom, teachers can increase learners' motivation, inspiring students' determination and perseverance to learn. Teachers' achievements and good examples can also encourage students to strive harder. If the motivation is powerful, the rest of the learning process will be easy and effective for students. Motivation from teachers can build confidence and character among students. The participants shared,

> *As a blind person, I am dependent, or perhaps we students with disability depend on how we are motivated by the teachers. Like in our case, our professor has motivated me so much that I have loved research so much right now. Also, our other professor has motivated me to love research. That is why, right now, I am very much in love with it.*
>
> *In my case, professors really affect how I look at research. I am not an academician by profession. I am a teacher by circumstance. It takes some inspiration for me to appreciate where I am now. So, it is good to meet somebody who inspires me to give more attention to research.*
>
> *Our professors greatly inspired me because they have been there when we needed help. You will feel an invisible connection with them and feel good when you have those kinds of people. My professors in this university are my angels and strength in research.*

The Overlapping Truth: Exploring the Lived Experiences of Graduate Students in Research Writing

Suitable approaches unlock difficulties. The ease of understanding research is very much dependent on the way the teacher teaches the students. Since research is a complicated subject, as perceived by students, teachers must find ways to deliver in the simplest way to promote learning. Teaching approaches that are translated in the classroom must lead to the achievement of the specific goals in research. Approaches are considered suitable for students if they are designed based on the needs of the students and they will engage students in the learning process. The participants narrated,

> When I went to college, I really struggled a lot in research because, in our school, research was introduced in a very complicated manner, which was very difficult to understand. But when I came here, it was the opposite. I realized that in research, you will just focus on the specific details. So today, it is just like free of stress.
>
> I realized that research, indeed, is very simple. And it depends on how it is delivered or thrown to us. Upon enrolling in this subject this semester, the use of the OKFIQ opened my mind to the process of research, an organized and systematic process. With the OKFIQ, I can already see where my study is heading.
>
> At first, I really struggled with how to cope with everything, but the good thing is that the teacher discussed this subject step by step with us. It is a good thing that the parts of the research were presented step by step. It is more of a workshop rather than a pure lecture. Each part was discussed thoroughly, so we learned how to do it independently.

Quality teachers mirror the quality of instruction. Committing to quality instruction would entail quality teachers. Quality teachers are evident in the achievements of students. Students must meet certain learning targets and must make continuous progress. Instead of the students adjusting to their teacher, teachers should adjust the instruction to fit the diverse learning needs of the students. Through this, all learning gaps will be filled in. The participants mentioned,

> As I usually ask, would that be possible for those teachers who will handle research are those teachers who are already master's degree holders or, most probably, doctorate graduates who really know what research is? These teachers must know how to handle students to lessen the burden of work. As our professor told us, these teachers must have a grasp of research and an eye for research.
>
> The one who will handle research must be somebody who knows research. I am not yet confident in research writing, although I am trying to learn and read. Maybe, it really matters if you are a master's or doctorate holder. These teachers must understand what they are discussing with the students. Their level of competence must be high in handling research. That is maybe the reason why other students are complaining about the kind of teacher they have.
>
> But this will really require you to understand all the areas in research. This understanding can be acquired through the help of experienced professors who know what to teach and how to teach.

The Significance of Self-concept. As a distinct component of self-concept, self-worth is not simply a summary statement of self-perceptions across different domains of competency (e.g., academics, social, behavioral, physical). Rather, it is measured by its own set of items that tap into general happiness, satisfaction, and overall effect on oneself (Bear et al., 2002). Self-concept is the nucleus of personality and a core factor affecting individual behavior; in addition, self-concept gradually develops from the infant stage and could evolve substantially as people grow in considerably diverse environments, such as the environment in which they interact with various people or receive a specific type of education (Chen et al., 2015). Academic self-concept indicates students' perceptions and self-evaluations of their overall abilities (Ecang & Petalla, 2022), compared with the abilities of others in achievement situations (Marsh, 1990; Waugh, 2002).

Attitudes and beliefs affect one's appreciation. The action of the person depends on his attitude and beliefs. It is even reflected in the quality of his works and his dealings with the situations. A positive attitude will most likely have positive effects, and a negative attitude will create unconstructive effects. The same is true with research. Quality output can only be achieved with a positive attitude and belief. The participants responded,

> In that rediscovering, it pushed you to see familiar problems that we could actually encounter in our daily lives or even in our classrooms and it is being addressed in research. That is why I appreciate research very much because I found value in it.
>
> Somehow, I am enjoying it as well. I am very much positive towards research. In this case, I would still do research if given a chance.
>
> If given a chance to do another study, I think I will still be willing to do it. Conducting research is an eye-opener for me that will make me understand a lot of things. I realize that when you really put your effort into a topic, you will enjoy it, even if it is tiring.

Interest and appreciation motivate creativity. External factors may contribute to the researcher, but his interest would be the greatest aspect in achieving his intended goal. It is of great help when a person works on something of significance. Interest changes the attitude of a person toward something he is interested in. Curiosity and the determination to learn are also products of one's interest in a certain idea. Appreciation comes after the achievement of one's objective. The participants verbalized,

The Overlapping Truth: Exploring the Lived Experiences of Graduate Students in Research Writing

It is important that your study is something near to your heart. This would be a great help for you to finish your study. In this research subject that I have, I like it because the teacher allowed us to work on a topic close to our heart, something related to our field and something we can relate to.

If we had already experienced this kind of teaching from the beginning, we should have loved research earlier. My passion and interest in research came late. The interest in me really took a long time for me to realize how important research is. I really started from zero until my passion for research took off.

It is also good that we are allowed to work based on our own interests. We were given time to identify our strengths and weaknesses. Thus, we were able to identify the field that we are good at. Having a topic of your own choice based on your interest is something very helpful in conducting the study, especially in the choice of the topic. I can work better on the topic that I like. If you are interested in the topic, you can easily find related literature.

Self-direction and realization open possibilities. Challenges are dealt with in different ways by different people. It is just a matter of re-directing oneself toward the ultimate goal. It is, therefore, necessary for the students to have a clear direction as to where research is leading them. One must focus and set clear objectives, which will serve as his guide in the research journey. Achieving these goals will lead to a total understanding of what research is. The participants narrated,

So far, research is still bulky and heavy, but by studying through and through and with constant practice, research will just be easy. As long as you know what you are studying and what you are capable of doing, you will handle research with ease.

You have to spend all your effort reading and getting information related to your topic. You need to read the works of other researchers. Even though others felt it heavy and tiring, for me, it was good because while reading what the teacher had assigned to us, I learned a lot, and the more I read, the more I realized that I needed to learn more.

Independence and confidence maximize new discoveries. Confidence is always paired with skill, and with skill, one can be independent. Independence is a requirement for leading your way towards your goal. It is being able to do things on your own appropriately with confidence. However, independence does not mean that you do not need anybody because, in research, other people's perspectives are very significant. The participants verbalized,

And here comes research. You will really stand on your own. You have to discover things and understand things by yourself.

When we were still in college, research was done by group. So, I have other members who can help me. But for me, it is much better if I work individually than to work with a group. If I am working alone, I can design techniques for doing things.

So, before I entered this class, I was very scared, and I am not sure if I can do it alone since I am used to having group mates. But somehow, I did it on my own, without my group mates. For example, in the case of OKFIQ, I did not expect that I could make it without my group mates. I became so dependent on them that I lost my confidence in doing my work.

Conflict and constraint limit quality and innovation. Research requires time and energy, and it also requires organization and planning. It requires total dedication to be able to come up with a good study. However, graduate students are also working and cannot give all their time to research. Thus, curriculum is also one factor to be considered to lessen the burden on our students. It must be well-planned in consideration of the load of work of the students who are also working at the same time. As shared by the participants,

Our problem now is that we have both the qualitative and the quantitative in one semester. We still have another subject that we must also focus on. If we just have one research subject this semester, maybe we can focus more on our work and give better output. But our situation is something very difficult and complicated.

But two hours is two hours, especially if you are working and still have kids to care for. It is really difficult. You can probably start reading at 11 o'clock in the evening, which is already too late. Even if you are tired and sleepy, you still have to continue doing your expected output. Of course, you cannot expect too much from our output.

4.0 DISCUSSION

Research writing requires one's experiences (retrospective learning) and continuous practice (experiential learning) with self-concept (internalization). It cannot be learned in one setting. It is learned through past experiences and continuous practice, knowing one's strengths, weaknesses, capabilities, and attitude.

Learning from past experiences requires a process of reconstruction. Practitioners can generate and reorganize professional knowledge through ongoing discussions of past experiences. The analysis of past experiences leads practitioners to a new understanding of practical situations and an exploration of preconceived tacit assumptions about teaching.

Consequently, learning from past experiences leads to a better self-understanding, a better understanding of teaching, and a better integration between the two (Grimmett, 1988).

Further, experiential learning, described as learning through participation in experiences, is often cited as a foundational tenet of teaching (McKim et al., 2017). Experiential learning is not a new concept. In fact, early apprenticeship models of education were experiential in nature (Furco, 1996). Dewey's contributions to our understanding of experiential learning extended beyond identifying the importance of experiences in education. As Dewey sharpened his focus, he articulated a process by which experiences lead to learning, leading to a pragmatic model of reflective thought and action (Dewey, 1916/2007, cited in McKim et al., 2017).

Based on the narratives of the participants, several themes were culled from their lived experiences. They consider their experience very important in how they look at research at present, and their experience includes their prior knowledge, the untaught skills that they should have learned, and the wrong perceptions they have about research. These are all from their experiences at the undergraduate level and even at the secondary level. Several studies focus on the effectiveness of undergraduate research programs. Undergraduate research experiences in a class were distinguished from those involving individualized participation in a research program. Students' experiences and perceptions about research from mentoring emerge as both an important component of a successful experience and a target for improvement (Linn et al., 2015).

The influence of teachers also affects their experiences, especially the motivation given by teachers, the suitability of the approaches used in introducing research to them, and the quality of instruction that teachers give them. One way to promote learning in the classroom is through the teacher's instructional style, as flexible methods of instruction focus on the learner and his/her interests and needs, raise the motivation to learn, and naturally may reduce misbehavior (Baloglu, 2009).

Further, the way they look at themselves affects how they perceived research writing. Their attitude and beliefs, their interest and appreciation, and their independence and confidence are part of self-concept. It also depends on how they redirect themselves and what they realize amidst challenges in research writing. Conflict and constraint also affect how they define research (Shah et al., 2013). Attitudes are important in research education because once the attitudes are formed, they are long-lasting and difficult to change (Fishbein & Ajzen, 1980). Attitudes towards research affect students' participation and impact performance in the said field.

5.0 CONCLUSION

Research is one of the most important aspects to develop among graduate students to become globally competitive, competent, productive, and employable. However, research is also perceived to be the most difficult subject in the curriculum, even in graduate school. Doing research can be easy or difficult for graduate students based on their perception of research, even before the actual writing process. The presence of desirable and undesirable elements could positively or negatively affect students' competence (knowledge, skills, and attitude) in writing research. What they have learned in their experiences in the past affects their personal way of perceiving research as a subject and how they will consider research in the future.

In light of the findings, the researcher recommends the development of a research culture in the institution that would encourage students to participate, learn, and embrace research not only in school but in all their dealings in life, especially in their professions. Likewise, there is a need for the re-orientation and training of teachers, especially on how to bridge the gap in students' readiness in terms of knowledge, skills, and attitudes toward research. Further, training on teaching pedagogy, specifically in teaching research, must also be given to teachers to help motivate students and not discourage them. For future researchers, further study on a wider range can be conducted to validate the findings of the study.

REFERENCES

1) Baloglu, N. (2009). Negative behavior of teachers with regard to high school students in classroom settings. *Journal of Instructional Psychology, 36*(1), 69–78. Retrieved from https://search.proquest.com/docview/213900639?accountid=34542

2) Bear, G. G., Minke, K. M., & Manning, M. A. (2002). Self-concept of students with learning disabilities: A meta-analysis. *School Psychology Review, 31*(3), 405. Retrieved from https://search.proquest.com/docview/219654574?accountid=34542

3) Buenacosa, M. S. A., & Petalla, M. B. (2022). Embracing the Unknown: Adaptability and Resiliency of Out-of-Field Secondary Teachers Teaching English in Public Schools. *Asian Journal of Education and Social Studies*, *37*(2), 1–29. https://doi.org/10.9734/ajess/2022/v37i2796

4) Burke, L.E., Schlenk, E.A., Sereika, S. M., Cohen, S. M., Happ, M.B., & Dorman, J. S. (2005). Developing Research Competence to Support Evidence-Based Practice, *Journal of Professional Nursing,* Volume 21, Issue 6, Pages 358-363, ISSN 8755-7223, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.profnurs.2005.10.011.

5) Ch., S. A., Batool, A., & Dilshad, S. A. (2021). Attitude of Prospective Teachers towards Research: A Survey Study of Different IER Programs. *Global Social Sciences Review*, VI(II), 87-93. https://doi.org/10.31703/gssr.2021(VIII).09

6) Chen, B. H., Chiu, W., & Wang, C. (2015). The relationship among academic self-concept, learning strategies, and academic achievement: A case study of national vocational college students in Taiwan via SEM. *The Asia - Pacific Education Researcher, 24*(2), 419-431. doi: http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s40299-014-0194-1

7) CMO 21 (1999). Strengthening Research Advocacy in Higher Education Through the Philippine Association of Graduate Education (PAGE)- NHERA Related Activity. http://116.50.242.167/nlpdl/CH01/MO/1999/CH0MO0021s1999.pdf

8) CMO 46 (2012). Policy-Standard to Enhance Quality Assurance (QA) in Philippine Higher Education Through an Outcomes-based And Typology-Based QA. http://www.pacu.org.ph/wordpress/wp-content/uploads/2017/03/CMO-No.46-s2012.pdf

9) Cousins, B. (1998). Intellectual roots of organizational learning. In K. Leithwood & K. S. Louis (Eds.), Organizational learning in schools (pp. 219–236). Lisse, Netherlands: Swets & Zeitlinger.

10) Cozzens S. E. (2010). Quality of life returns from basic research. *Health research policy and systems*, *8*, 18. https://doi.org/10.1186/1478-4505-8-18

11) Davidson, Z.E., & Palermo, C. (2015). Developing research competence in undergraduate students through hands-on learning, *Journal of Biomedical Education*, Vol. 2015, Article ID 306380, 9 pages, https://doi.org/10.1155/2015/306380.

12) Dewey, J. (1916/2007). *Essays in experimental logic.* Carbondale and Edwardsville: Southern Illinois University Press.

13) Ecang, V. S. S., & Petalla, M. B. (2022). A Metamorphic Experience of Students-at-Risk-of Dropping-Out in the Printed Modular Distance Learning in Time of COVID-19 Pandemic. *Philippine Social Science Journal*, 5(1), 49-56. https://doi.org/10.52006/main.v5i1.470

14) Fishbein, M., & Ajzen, I. (1975). *Belief, Attitude, Intention, and Behaviour: An introduction to theory and research*. London: Addison-Wesley.

15) Franzenburg, G. (2017). Learning from the past for the future: How to make adult education sustainable. Discourse and Communication for Sustainable Education, Vol.8, Issue 2. https://doi.org/10.1515/dcse-2017-0015

16) Hallinan, M. T. (2008). Teacher influences on students' attachment to school. *Sociology of Education, 81*(3), 271-283. doi:http://dx.doi.org/10.1177/003804070808100303

17) Hinkka, H., Kosunen, E., Metsänoja, R., Lammi, U., & Kellokumpu-Lehtinen, P. (2002). Factors affecting physicians' decisions to forgo life-sustaining treatments in terminal care. *Journal of Medical Ethics, 28*(2), 109. doi:http://dx.doi.org/10.1136/jme.28.2.109

18) Gaizauskaité, I. (2012). THE USE OF THE FOCUS GROUP METHOD IN SOCIAL WORK RESEARCH. *Socialinis Darbas, 11*(1), 19-30. Retrieved from https://search.proquest.com/docview/1150207522?accountid=34542

19) Grimmett, P. P. (1988). The nature of reflection and Schon's conception in perspective. In P. P. Grimmett & G. L. Erickson (Eds.), Reflection in teacher education (pp. 5–16). New York: Pacific Educational Press.

20) Gross, R. (2001). *Psychology: The science of mind and behaviour. London: Hodder and Stoughton*, retrieved from http://www.hkadesigns.co.uk/ websites/msc/reme/likert.htm on 09/07/2013

21) Linn, M. C., Palmer, E., Baranger, A., Gerard, E., & Stone, E. (2015). Undergraduate research experiences: Impacts and opportunities. *Science, 347*(6222) http://dx.doi.org/10.1126 /science.1261757

22) Lichtman, M. (2010). *Qualitative research in education: A user's guide.* CA: Sage Publications.

23) Lichtman, M. (2013). *Qualitative research in education: a user's guide*. 3rd ed. Thousand Oaks: SAGE Publications, pp. 241–268.

24) Lichtman, M. (2014). *Qualitative research for the social sciences.* SAGE Publications, Inc. https://doi.org/10.4135/9781544307756

25) Madrigal, D. V. (2015). Responding to the challenges of employment through graduate attributes. *Recoletos Multidisciplinary Research Journal,* 3(1). https://doi.org/10.32871/rmrj1503.01.10

26) Malagsic, M., Petalla, M., & Doromal, A. (2021). Self-efficacy and Work Commitment of the Private Senior High School Teachers in Time of Pandemic. *International Journal of Sciences: Basic and Applied Research (IJSBAR).* 60. 345-359. https://rb.gy/s3isn

27) Marsh, H. W. (1990). A multidimensional, hierarchical self-concept: The Marsh/Shavelson model. *Journal of Educational Psychology,* 82, 623–636

28) McKim, A. J., Greenhaw, L., Jagger, C., Redwine, T., & McCubbins, O. P. (2017). Emerging opportunities for interdisciplinary application of experiential learning among colleges and teachers of agriculture. *NACTA Journal, 61*(4), 310–316. Retrieved from https://search.proquest.com/docview/2001048336?accountid=34542

29) Mishra, P. & Kereluik, K. (2011). What 21st Century Learning? A review and a synthesis. In M. Koehler & P. Mishra (Eds.), *Proceedings of SITE 2011--Society for Information Technology & Teacher Education International Conference* (pp. 3301-3312). Nashville, Tennessee, USA: Association for the Advancement of Computing in Education (AACE). Retrieved from https://www.learntechlib.org/primary/p/36828/.

30) Mohajan, H. (2018). Qualitative Research Methodology in Social Sciences and Related Subjects, *Journal of Economic Development, Environment and People,* Vol-7, Issue 01, 2018, pp. 23–48. https://mpra.ub.uni-muenchen.de/85654/

31) Obuku, E.A., Lavis, J.N., Kinengyere, A., Sengooba, F., Karamagi, C., & Sewankambo, N.K. (2017). Academic research productivity of postgraduate students at Makerere University College of Health Sciences, Uganda, from 1996 to 2010: A retrospective review. doi:10.1186/s12961-017-0194-8.

32) Onderwijsraad (2014). *Meer innovatieve professionals (More innovative professionals)*. Den Haag: Onderwijsraad.

33) Owusu-Bempah, J. (2014). How can we best interpret effective leadership? the case for Q method. *Journal of Business Studies Quarterly, 5*(3), 47-58. Retrieved from https://search.proquest.com/docview/1520924280?accountid=34542

34) Petalla, M. B., & Doromal, A. C. (2021). Students in the real-world of performance tasks assessment: A qualitative inquiry. *Philippine Social Science Journal*, 4(1), 53-60. https://doi.org/10.52006/main.v4i1.312

35) Petalla, M. B., & Madrigal, D. V. (2017). Teaching standards competence and efficiency performance of the basic education teachers. University of Negros Occidental-Recoletos, Bacolod City, Philippines. *Journal of Institutional Research in South East Asia* – Vol. 15 No.3 Dec 2017

36) Rijksoverheid (2015). *De waarde(n) van weten (The value(s) of knowing). Strategische agenda Hoger Onderwijs en Onderzoek 2015-2025 (Strategic agenda on Higher Education and Research 2015-2025)*. Den Haag: Rijksoverheid.

37) Rogers, S. W., & Goktas, R. K. (2010). Exploring engineering graduate student research proficiency with student surveys. *Journal of Engineering Education, 99*(3), 263-278. Retrieved from
https://search.proquest.com/docview/744366821?accountid=34542
Shah, Z. A., Mahmood, N., & Harrison, C. (2013). Attitude towards science learning: An exploration of Pakistani students. *Journal of Turkish Science Education, 10*(2) Retrieved from
https://search.proquest.com/docview/1659748148?accountid=34542

38) Shaukat, S., Siddiquah, A., Abiodullah, M., & Akbar, R.A. (2014). Postgraduate students' attitude towards research. *Bulletin of Education and Research*, v36 n1 p111-122. https://eric.ed.gov/?id=EJ1210436

39) Urinova, N. M., & Abdullaeva, N. (2021). Opportunities to use project-based teaching technology in the development of students' research competence. *ACADEMIA: An International Multidisciplinary Research Journal,* Volume 11, Issue 3, Pages 2344-2348, DOI:10.5958/2249-7137.2021.00860.0

40) Van, D. Z. (2012). Inspiration: A thought-provoking concept for RE teachers. *British Journal of Religious Education, 34*(1), 21. Retrieved from https://search.proquest.com/docview/909807720?accountid=34542

41) Virany, B., Tushman, M., & Romanelli, E. (1996). Executive succession and organization outcomes in turbulent environments: An organizational learning approach. In M. D. Cohen & E. S. Sproull (Eds.), Organizational learning (pp. 302–329). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

42) Waugh, R. F. (2002). Measuring self-reported studying and learning for university students: Linking attitudes and behaviours on the same scale. *British Journal of Educational Psychology*, 72(4), 573–604.

43) Wilson, B. A. (2008). Predicting intended unethical behavior of business students. *Journal of Education for Business, 83*(4), 187–195. Retrieved from https://search.proquest.com/docview/202821285?accountid=34542

44) Yarullin, I. F., Bushmeleva, N. A., & Tsyrkun, I. I. (2015). The Research Competence Development of Students Trained in Mathematical Direction. *International Electronic Journal of Mathematics Education, 10*(3), 137-146. https://doi.org/10.29333/iejme/296